

## intr duction

The Spot the Difference Study aims to offer a new perspective on an age-old issue. We will not propose a list of recommendations. Rather, we will explore the factors that impact the career choices of women and men and the reasons why these choices are often so different. We aim to offer organisations perspective on the current efficacy of their workplace policies and who they are really benefitting.

Gender diversity in the workplace has been a topic of discussion in the corporate world for some time. One consistent challenge has been

## Spot the Difference focus

Which factors are most influential when women and men make their career choices and how they differ between genders?
We explore the following in particular:

- How effective are corporate policies and from whose perspective?
- Which factors influence
career choices?
- Does society dictate that men
and women will forever make
different choices?
- Are corporate policies really making an impact to enable both genders to reach their potential? to present recommendations which specifically resolve some of the issues faced by women and men at work.

Such recommendations are absorbed into corporate diversity agendas and prioritised by many organisations. Some have a dedicated diversity department that sets goals and launches initiatives to drive sustained diversity across the organisation.

However, we should not be complacent. The media are often full of headline-making progress, the appointment of a female CEO, or the recipient of a diversity award, but, after a while, momentum is lost. After a burst of progress in the last decade, progress has slowed.

So, what is stopping us from progressing further? What are the major barriers to sustainable equality in the workplace ecosystem? Surely, in the digital age, and with changing family structures and more gender balance across public life, equality is possible? If equality and diversity policies are stronger than ever, perhaps the problem lies elsewhere: in the choices that men and women are making?

## WE ARE EXPLORING THE FOLLOWING ASPECTS IN PARTICULAR:

- The principal factors which impact career choices
- How effective company policies are in guiding these choices
- How impactful corporate diversity policies are in informing the career choices of women and men
- To what extent these policies are effective relative to other societal influences


## $6000+$



SECTORS ENCOMPASSED


INTERVIEWS

## Enquiry

While this research seeks to identify how men and women differ in the choices they make, it also uncovers similarities. Some of the most significant findings are areas of congruence that run contrary to conventional assumptions.

Additional querying through a generational lens evaluates whether some of the differences diverge or converge.

For the purpose of this study, a gap of 3 percentage points or less is considered a notable "similarity" while a gap of 4 percentage points or more is considered a notable "difference".


## invdvement



## KIRSTY BASHFORTH

QUAYFIVE LTD
SpotDiffUK Project Director

Kirsty advises companies on performance improvement through organisational culture. She spent 24 years at BP, and as well as running QuayFive is a non-executive director of Kier Group, an independent governor of Leeds Beckett University and has an Economics degree from Cambridge University.
 field-based engineering, finance and management roles across multiple countries.

She has worked extensively on gender and generational dynamics throughout this time. She has a Bachelor of Science in Mechanical Engineering from Pennsylvania State University in the US.

## HELENA ECCLES

THINK FUTURE
SpotDiffUK Research Advisor

Helena is Founder of the Think Future Study which explores how students, particularly women, feel their university experiences shape and influence their personal and professional aspirations. She advises major companies on how to conduct research projects at scale and attract and retain top female talent.

Helena is a graduate in Modern and Medieval Languages from Cambridge University and starts work with McKinsey in February 2018. She is a member of the World Economic Forum's Global Shapers Community.

## Insights Committee

Providing governance and oversight of the survey, insights and report

TIM COBLEY, Rio Tinto
LUCY KNIGHT, BP
OLIVIA PERKINS, Kier Group
MARJORIE STRACHAN, RBS
STEVEN WEBB, FTSE 250 Exco

## Participating Organisations

Alpha Financial Consulting, BP, BSI, Centrica, Diageo, Fidelity, IBM, Kier Group, Lookers, NEST, Rio Tinto, RBS and Wessex Water.

## forew rd <br> by BP



Diversity and Inclusion has been a focus in the corporate world for many years. We have seen significant changes in society and as a result our thinking has evolved. We are seeing more practical and fit-for-purpose approaches in the workplace to ensure equal opportunity and inclusion for all employees.

We know from research that gender and ethnically diverse companies are more likely to outperform their less-diverse peers*. We also know an inclusive organisation cultivates a productive and fulfilling environment for employees to work and develop.

The business case for diversity has long been established, however, there is still more for business and society to learn. It is critical we understand more deeply the corporate and societal causes and effects that are driving employee choices.

# BP's D\&I chronology <br> <br> 2002 

 <br> <br> 2002}

Sir John Browne CEO Berlin speech
"The business case for diversity"

## 2006

Wins Catalyst award

## 2012

Sets global goals for gender

## 2016

Commissions research to reflect on progress and opportunity

## 2017

Emphasis on inclusion as underpinning for sustained diversity

With these factors in mind, we commissioned Spot the Difference to gain insights on differences and similarities beween women's and men's career choices, including:

- How they perceive their organisation's Diversity and Inclusion policies
- What factors influence their career aspirations and decisions
- How they view their organisation's progress toward gender balance.

While it might be early to draw final conclusions and make recommendations, the findings of this research provide new perspectives. There are two initial thoughts I would like to share:

- First, we need to be far more aware of generational differences as we consider and formulate diversity and inclusion policies - Second, we need to reflect on the efficacy of current practices, as some well-intended policies may have negative, unintended consequences; what makes a good headline may not always serve the long term purpose of a more inclusive environment.

My thanks go to those organisations and individuals who participated. I hope you find the insights gained stimulating and useful.

## HELMUT SCHUSTER GROUP HRD

 BP PLC
# executive summary 

## Similarities between <br> men and women <br> in the workplace:

- their definition of personal success and fulfilment
- how prepared they feel to take on new roles
- the reasons for changing jobs or sectors
- the driving factors for their career aspirations


## Societal factors

The relationship between societal factors and the effectiveness of corporate initiatives is complex and evolving. There is evidence of some social norms breaking down and a demand for policies to keep up with those changes

## Age



WOMEN and MEN at the start
of their careers reported being
as ambitious and financially driven as each other, however their choices and definitions of personal success diverged with age.

## Where the differences emerge

Beneath the headlines, there are differences between men and women in five main areas outlined below. These differences also vary with age.

## Aspiration and ambitions

WOMEN showed greater variance in their aspirations over time. They were more likely to take a leave of absence, and more likely to cite fulfilment as a reason to return.

MEN showed a smaller variance in aspirations over time. They were less likely to have taken a leave of absence and more likely to have returned for financial reasons.

## Defining success

WOMEN reported greater emphasis on development and relationships.

MEN reported greater emphasis on financial measures.

## Sources of support

WOMEN reported using wider sources of support and guidance, a greater range of reasons and timeframes to seek it, and used it for personal credibility.

MEN reported using a narrower set of sources from which to gain support, fewer occasions to seek that input and used it to build technical skills and their personal credibility

## Confidence in the system

WOMEN responsed show less trust in the fairness and effectiveness of the system and were less likely to see a clear career path ahead.

MEN responsed show more trust in the fairness and effectiveness of the system and were more likely to believe they are offered high visibility roles.

## Views of progress

WOMEN cited gender-based initiatives having greater potential business impact, but had less confidence in their current effectiveness.

MEN reported higher confidence that gender balance is a priority for management and cited more overall progress.

# where men and w men are 

## Top 2

 elements defining personal success

[^0]
## $\equiv 71 \%_{\text {maxe }}$ $76 \%$

I AM OFFERED ROLES FOR WHICH I AM SUITABLY QUALIFIED

The majority of both men and women felt prepared for roles they were offered, with the reasons for changes in career aspirations highly aligned. The majority of both men and women who moved company or industry cited financial or advancement opportunities, as their reason for change.

Top 3 reasons for change
in career aspiration:

- Bad experience at work
- Personal progress and promotion
- Having children

Why move?

# where men and winen 

## Corporate initiatives and policies

Both men and women reported broadly similarly positive views of the value, direction and impact of corporate gender-based initiatives.

Men and women cited similar policies which they felt most aided progression and had similar views of the value added

The same TOP 2 most impactful policies aiding progression

- Professional training
- Flexible working
(rated top by both men and women)

"There are concrete practical steps that we could put in place, for example, we could remove names from CV/s when assessing a role so you can't tell the gender."
FEMALE 20s

The results reflect alignment between men and women on which policies can be most effective, as well as the importance of consistent application, regardless of gender, in order for these policies to be effective. Such policies included flexible working arrangements, tapering hours for retirees, and anonymising applications.
"If gender equality
is the aim, policies directed at supporting families, rather than only supporting new mothers, would be a good place to start."

MALE 30s

## s cietal factors

A complex and evolving picture emerges concerning the influence of societal factors on perceptions, priorities and choices. The data shows that societal factors cannot be ignored in the workplace. However, the data also shows that societal norms are shifting.

Both men and women cited societal change and further progress toward gender equality in the workplace as being interdependent.

## Some societal <br> norms are contradicted

> When defining success, men were more likely to cite family responsibilities than women. Men also reported marriage to be a more significant influence on their aspirations than women (albeit both at low levels).

## Personal definitions of success

More MEN cited

- Having children
- Being a supportive spouse

More WOMEN cited

- Intellectual fulfilment
- Respect in chosen field
- A job I enjoy
- Ability to travel


## BEING A SUPPORTIVE

 PARTNER OR SPOUSE(important / very important)


61\% 68\%

## HAVING CHILDREN

(important / very important)
"Until companies make it as attractive for men to take an equal role in child care we will continue to see gender imbalance. In summary, companies are creating environments where it is acceptable for women to both provide childcare and work but not for men"

MALE 40s

## Moments influencing a change in aspirations

## $5 \%$ remale <br> 9\% ${ }_{\text {MALE }}$

## GETTING MARRIED

(share of response when asked for top 3)

## Some societal norms are corroborated

On a macro level, far more men reported being the primary earners and men were more likely to cite financial reasons for returning to work following a leave of absence. Respondents also reported a perceived negative impact from flexible working arrangements despite technological advances.

## What were your primary reasons for returning to work?

$28 \%$
-37\%
BEING THE PRIMARY EARNER


## PERSONAL FULFILMENT, <br> CHALLENGE OR GROWTH

"I feel a large part of the problem is actually that we create a 'white male' culture and instead of resolving this, we teach people to behave like white males to succeed"

MALE 40s
> "Every time anyone talks about women's initiatives, it's always tied to children and maternity pay, maternity leave, anything to do with kids or flexibility to do with family, being a wife, being a mother; and speaking as a single, childless woman in her 30s, that disenfranchises me and other single women because they feel overlooked."

FEMALE 30s

## FLEXIBLE WORKING

## ARRANGEMENTS

Corporate policies which have
benefited your career progression
(\% of respondents that included this policy)

## Policy relevance and application

The data shows an inconsistent picture of understanding, application and relevance of family-friendly policies, with many references to flexible working policies only understood to apply to women with children, thereby creating a sense of exclusion and special treatment.

Several references were made to the need for tapering hours for those in retirement in order to maintain vital experience and in recognition of the tendency of more and more workers to live longer beyond retirement age. Respondents also emphasised the need for a work environment more conducive to "returners".


# where the differences emerge 

While there is consistency across the headline definitions of success reported by men and women, there are some key differences.

Women were more likely to cite development and relationships as indicators of success, while men showed comparatively greater focus on monetary aspects.

## defining success <br> What gives you a sustained sense of satisfaction and fulfilment in the workplace?

(\% of responses within top 3 elements)

MONETARY COMPENSATION
BEING GIVEN DEVELOPMENT OPPORTUNITES

SENSE OF COMMUNITY OR CLOSE RELATIONSHIPS WITH COWORKERS


$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { 46\% 54\% } \\
& \text { 28\% 21\% } \\
& \text { 24\% 15\% }
\end{aligned}
$$

MEN were more likely to change industry or company due to

- Company or industry instability
- Uncertainty

WOMEN were more likely to change industry or company due to

- Workload or time commitment
- Culture
- Change in personal circumstances
- Difficult relationship with boss
"While at work I want to climb as high as I can in my career and my motivation is money
so I can better enjoy my off time."

MALE 20s


## FEMALE 40s

# O <br> aspiratins <br> and ambiti ns 

More women reported chang in their aspirations and views of success over time than men.
They were more likely to have had a career break and cited different reasons for returning.

# Volatility of career aspirations 

MY PERSONAL DEFINITION OF A SUCCESSFUL CAREER HAS REMAINED CONSISTENT THROUGHOUT MY CAREER

MY LEVEL OF AMBITION
HAS NOT CHANGED SINCE BEGINNING MY CAREER


28\% 37\% 37\% 42\%

# "As I have aged my levels of ambition have not necessarily changed, but rather the ambitions themselves have broadened..." 

FEMALE 30s

# "Ambitions have changed depending on the direct team leader. Where these team leaders have been poor I have found myself losing ambition and drive." 

## What was your primary reason for returning to work? <br>  <br> 37\% <br> <br> \title{ 28\% <br> <br> \title{ 28\% <br> <br> <br> 46\% 

 <br> <br> <br> 46\%} <br> 28\%}

## aspırati ns <br> and ambiti ns

Women were more
likely to report changes
in aspirations and views
of success over time than men. They were more likely to have had a career break and cited different reasons for returning.

Moments influencing a change in aspirations


> "Having a family did not change my drive or career ambition, however, it changed the hours I am available. I have had to work smarter and flexibly and have found great success working with leaders who have open minds about how work gets done."

FEMALE 30s

Of the women who took an extended leave or career break, 54\% cited parental leave as the reason, while 4\% of MEN that took an extended leave or career break did so for parental leave.


## 30\% $35 \%$ max

## PROGRESS AND

 SUCCESS AT WORK"My ambition actually increased once I got married and had children. I was more confident and more able to prioritise my time and productivity."

FEMALE 40s

## 18\% $11 \%$ max

MAJOR LIFE DISRUPTION


## urces of supp <br> Men and women

reported consulting different sources when making career choices. Women consulted more widely to inform their career decisions and at earlier stages of the decision process.

## More likely

to consult for guidance

## MEN

- Partner or spouse


HAS A MENTOR

- Direct line manager


## WOMEN

- Other family members and friends
- Mentors and coaches
- Networks
"I'm constantly talking to people about what l'm going to do next... I talk to my boss, my colleagues, my friends, and to some degree my family. I have some mentors as well, so i'm always looking for new people to talk to."

FEMALE 20s
"The major impact recently has been having a great mentor, line manager and network of support which has put me in a position to take a senior leadership role. I feel I may have been able to do this myself, but I needed a push from others to believe in myself again.'

FEMALE 30s

Female respondents were more likely to believe that a wide range of people are able to hinder or support their career
(strongly agree / agree)

INCLUSIVENESS OF TEAM HIGHLY INFLUENCES ABILITY TO PERFORM

## how supp rt is valued

More men cited the increased personal skillset that development and support helped them build. They were more likely to reference the skills that line managers helped them build as well as opportunities managers made available. They reported feeling supported when their manager helped them find development opportunities and their next roles.

Thinking of your personal definition of success, what do you most value today?<br>(share of references in top 3 picks)<br>

"I think that women need more reassurance then men do. Men will just go and do it."

More women reported professional development and accreditation as measures of success and cited the increased credibility and confidence these resources gave them. They were more likely to recount receiving support from their manager in the form of listening and providing feedback on development gaps. During interviews, women felt supported when their manager answered technical questions and set up regular meetings to provide direct feedback.
"Accreditation is
a way of showing
people that don't know you what you're capable of..."

FEMALE 20s
"Senior female sponsors have had a strong impact on me through their support for opportunities, development etc. Negative senior males have had an equally disabling and confidencediminishing impact on me through my recent career (5 years)."

## the matter age

The youngest age range of professional women reported higher focus on status and prestige compared to the same age-range of men.


IMPORTANCE PLACED ON STATUS/PRESTIGE (aged 18-24)

IMPORTANCE PLACED ON HIGH SALARY (aged 18-24)

## 63\% 58\% 88\% 75\%

More women than men cited accreditation and professional development as valuable in defining personal success. This difference increased with age, peaking at 55-59.

PROFESSIONAL ACCREDITATION AS AN ELEMENT IN DEFINING PERSONAL SUCCESS
(aged 55-59 stated Important / very important)


OLDER WOMEN REPORTED HAVING TAKEN FEWER EXTENDED LEAVES OR CAREER BREAKS


WOMEN RESPONDENTS UNDER 35 WERE MORE LIKELY THAN THEIR MALE COUNTERPARTS TO CITE CHILDREN AS IMPORTANT.
Beyond that age, men were more likely to cite them as important.
(elements that define personal success)


BEING A SUPPORTIVE PARTNER
increased for men and decreased for
women with rising age
(elements that define personal success)

# "Companies with more progressive and forwardthinking attitudes to commitments at home are more likely to get the best out of their employees." 

MALE 40s

## cOnfidence

 in thesystem
Fewer women than men said they believe the current workplace environment will recognise their worth, enable them to succeed and allow them to fulfil their potential.
 with the statement that they
understand their development and career progression path.

## 41\% FEMALE 35\% ${ }_{\text {max }}$

I FEEL ABLE TO FLEX THE PACE OF MY CAREER AND NOT LOSE CREDIBILITY LONG TERM
> "Personally, the more I see of what goes on the further up the chain the more I am put off progressing. I just can't be bothered with that level of politics."

FEMALE 30s

The findings indicate that women and men feel similarly prepared to take on new roles. However, women reported accessing a wider set of resources to feel supported when taking on new roles

Women reported less positive views than men in the following three areas:

- The clarity of their career path
- The impact of flexing their careers
- The opportunity to access high profile roles

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { "I've always been relatively } \\
& \text { ambitious and keen to be at } \\
& \text { executive level. Having kids } \\
& \text { hasn't changed that. But it } \\
& \text { has made me more weary } \\
& \text { of the corporate world, } \\
& \text { hierarchies and outmoded } \\
& \text { working practices that } \\
& \text { slow us down." } \\
& \text { female 3os }
\end{aligned}
$$

$52 \%$
I AM OFFERED HIGH VISIBILITY ROLES WITH CHALLENGING OBJECTIVES (agree / strongly agree)
${ }^{\circ}$ views

## of impact

 and pr gressMale and female respondents perceived the value and impact of gender initiatives differently.

More female respondents believed that business performance benefitted from gender-based initiatives. Male respondents believed more strongly than women that these policies are currently successful.


GENDER-BASED INITIATIVES HAVE THE POTENTIAL TO IMPROVE THE BUSINESS PERFORMANCE OF MY COMPANY
(agree / strongly agree)

## 50\% $73 \%$ mas

WOMEN CURRENTLY BENEFIT FROM DIVERSITY AND INCLUSION PROGRAMMES WITHIN MY COMPANY (agree / strongly agree)
"There is now no difference between men and women in career progress. The perception is lagging behind the reality. In my industry, it's not a problem anymore."

MALE 50s

# 54\% FEMALE <br> 68\% 

GENDER PARITY IS FOUND BY MANAGEMENT TO BE CRITICAL FOR THE COMPANY (agree / strongly agree)

More men trusted that management are prioritising gender equality and that women are benefiting from this. Men reported less support for positive action policies than women.
"It has gotten better, but I think people are perhaps celebrating before the job is done.
It just feels like
progress has been made, but there's a long way to go."

MALE 20s


## Social change and corporate policies

Responses have indicated that corporate policies are lagging behind the way we currently live and work, and do not yet sufficiently encompass the following:

- dual income careers
- variances in career pace
- flexible working
- impact of personal life on workplace priorities


## The diversity label is now counter-productive

Policies and initiatives labelled as gender-based are sometimes viewed as discriminatory and excluding. Other best practices are perceived to be applied only to women with children and not to the wider working population, thereby creating "diversity fatigue".

Younger generations expect policies and initiatives to be applicable for all.

## The impact of personal advisors

Women's confidence to make ambitious choices can be significantly impacted by those from whom they seek support and advice.

These advisors have a role, beyond passively acting as a sounding board. They can provide the proactive encouragement that enables women to fulfil their potential.

## Perspective matters

The pool of respondents is made up of currently active employees within international corporations and their views are therefore within that context. The sense of progress on workplace gender balance inferred from the overall results must take into account the more positive view of the significant share of older male respondents in order to avoid unconscious complacency. Policies crafted by a diverse team have a greater chance of increasing inclusion and opportunity for all.

Definitions of success, support and ambition are received with differing interpretations, and recommendations from this work should consider a $360^{\circ}$ view of these terms to overcome unconscious biases.
'One size fits all'
management won't really work. This may
not be a gender issue at all, but should look at how everyone can fulfil their potential."

FEMALE 20s
"Affirmative action/gender specific programmes, in my view, are beginning to become less effective. What is required is flexibility which is open to everyone."

## FEMALE 20s

"Two key individuals made a significant impact early on in my career by giving me the confidence in my ability and identifying transferrable skills which enabled me to successfully apply for roles where I did not have direct experience."

FEMALE 40s
"Trying to change women won't work. Change the expectations and the system."

## CONTACT

For further onformation on the contents of this report or the full survey contact

QUAYFIVE LTD
kirstybashforth@quayfive.com www.quayfive.com


[^0]:    Top 4 categories when asked "what gives you a sustained sense of satisfaction and fulfilment in the workplace?"

    - Monetary compensation • Making a difference
    - Being trusted to deliver • Finding your work fun or enjoyable

